

# ON GROUPS SATISFYING THE MAXIMAL CONDITION ON NON-NORMAL SUBGROUPS

GIOVANNI CUTOLO

ABSTRACT: The aim of this paper is the classification of non-noetherian locally graded groups satisfying the maximal condition on non-normal subgroups.

## 1. Introduction

In his papers [4,6,7] S.N.Černikov studied groups with the minimal condition on non-abelian subgroups, on non-normal subgroups, on abelian non-normal subgroups respectively.

This kind of researches on groups with the minimal condition on subgroups not verifying a certain property  $\mathcal{P}$  is related to two different topics in infinite group theory. On one side, they are part of Černikov’s investigation on groups with the minimal condition on given systems of subgroups; on the other side, they are connected with the problem of studying groups with many  $\mathcal{P}$ -subgroups. In particular, the minimal condition on non- $\mathcal{P}$ -subgroups may be regarded as a generalization of the property “every infinite subgroup has  $\mathcal{P}$ ” (considered for instance in [5] and [16]) and is clearly related to the property “every proper subgroup has  $\mathcal{P}$ ” as well.

In this spirit Phillips and Wilson [17] (see also [2,3,12]) and Kurdachenko and Pylaev [13] have proved for a number of properties  $\mathcal{P}$  (the property of being either serial or locally nilpotent and other stronger properties in [17]; the property of having finitely many conjugates in [13]) that a group  $G$  satisfying the minimal condition on non- $\mathcal{P}$ -subgroups and some extra hypotheses is either a Černikov group or a group all proper subgroups of which have the property  $\mathcal{P}$ . In particular, generalizing a Černikov’s result, Phillips and Wilson have shown that a locally graded group with the minimal condition on non-normal subgroups is either a Dedekind group or a Černikov group. Recall that a group  $G$  is *locally graded* if every non-trivial finitely generated subgroup of  $G$  has a non-trivial finite quotient. Every locally (soluble-by-finite) group is locally graded.

Aim of this paper is the study of the dual condition, the maximal condition on non-normal subgroups, which we will denote by  $\text{Max-}n^-$ . In contrast to the above-quoted result, it turns out that there exist non-noetherian non-Dedekind groups which satisfy  $\text{Max-}n^-$ . In fact, we obtain the following:

**Theorem.** *A locally graded group  $G$  satisfies  $\text{Max-}n^-$  if and only if it is of one of the following types:*

- (a)  $G$  is a noetherian group
- (b)  $G$  is a Dedekind group
- (c)  $G$  is a central extension of  $\mathbb{Z}(p^\infty)$  by a finitely generated Dedekind group
- (d)  $G$  is the direct product of  $\mathbb{Q}_2$  and a finite hamiltonian group.

In particular a non-noetherian locally graded group with  $\text{Max-}n^-$  is nilpotent of class 2 (Corollary 2.5). By studying groups with  $\text{Max-}n^-$  the class of those groups whose non-normal subgroups are finitely generated arises in a natural way. We will denote this class by  $\mathcal{D}$ . In §2 some properties of groups in  $\text{Max-}n^-$  or in  $\mathcal{D}$  are stated, the Theorem is proved and some of its consequences are pointed out. In §3 nilpotent  $\mathcal{D}$ -groups not in  $\text{Max-}n^-$  are discussed. It is also shown that a nilpotent group with the maximal condition on abelian non-normal subgroups satisfies  $\text{Max-}n^-$ . Finally we mention that a very special case of our problem has been recently considered by Hekster and Lenstra [11].

Our notation is mostly standard. In particular we refer to [18] and [19].

## 2. The class $\text{Max-}n^-$

**Lemma 2.1.** *Let  $G$  be a group satisfying the maximal condition on non-normal subgroups. Then:*

- (a)  $G$  is a  $\mathcal{D}$ -group.
- (b) The commutator subgroup  $G'$  of  $G$  satisfies the maximal condition. In particular  $G$  is locally noetherian.
- (c) The group  $G$  either is soluble or satisfies the maximal condition on abelian subgroups.

*Proof* — (a) Let  $H$  be a non-normal subgroup of  $G$ . Suppose, by contradiction, that  $H$  is not finitely generated. Let  $K$  be a subgroup of  $H$  which is maximal with respect to the condition of being finitely generated and non-normal in  $G$ . Since  $H$  is not finitely generated,  $K < H$ . For each  $x \in H \setminus K$ , the subgroup  $\langle K, x \rangle$  is normal in  $G$ . Hence  $H = \bigcup_{x \in H \setminus K} \langle K, x \rangle$  is normal in  $G$ . By this contradiction  $H$  is finitely generated.

(b) Let  $K$  be a cyclic subgroup of  $G$ . The interval  $[K^G/K]$  of the subgroup lattice of  $G$  satisfies the maximal condition. It follows by a standard argument that  $K^G$  satisfies the maximal condition on normal subgroups, and hence  $K^G$  satisfies the maximal condition on subgroups. If  $G$  is a Dedekind group, then  $G'$  is finite. If not, let  $H$  be a subgroup of  $G$  which is maximal with respect to the condition of being non-normal in  $G$ . Then  $H$  is finitely generated and, by the above,  $H^G$  satisfies the maximal condition. Moreover, by the choice of  $H$ , the quotient  $G/H^G$  is a Dedekind group, and so  $G'/(G' \cap H^G) \simeq G'H^G/H^G$  is finite. Therefore  $G'$  satisfies the maximal condition.

(c) Suppose that  $G$  contains an abelian subgroup  $A$  which is not finitely generated. Then  $A$  is normal in  $G$  and  $G/A$  is a Dedekind group by (a) and (b). Hence  $G$  is soluble.  $\square$

The proof of (a) in the previous lemma shows that a group with the maximal condition on finitely generated non-normal subgroups is a  $\mathcal{D}$ -group. Therefore  $\text{Max-}n^-$  is equivalent to the maximal condition on finitely generated non-normal subgroups.

The next two lemmas establish some restrictions for the centre of a non-Dedekind  $\mathcal{D}$ -group.

**Lemma 2.2.** *Let  $G$  be a non-Dedekind  $\mathcal{D}$ -group. Then  $Z(G) = T \times K$ , where  $T$  is either finite or direct product of a finite group and a Prüfer  $p$ -group ( $p$  prime) and  $K$  is torsion-free of finite rank. Furthermore:*

- (i) if  $T$  is infinite,  $K$  is finitely generated and every  $p'$ -subgroup of  $G$  is normal in  $G$ ;
- (ii) if  $G$  has a finite non-normal subgroup, then  $K$  is finitely generated.

*Proof* — Let  $H$  be a cyclic non-normal subgroup of  $G$ . Suppose that  $Z(G)$  has two subgroups  $A$  and  $B$  which are not finitely generated and such that  $A \cap B = H \cap Z(G)$ . Then  $AH$  and  $BH$  are normal in  $G$ , since they are not finitely generated. Hence  $H = HA \cap HB$  is normal in  $G$ , which is a contradiction. The first part of the lemma follows now readily. Moreover, if  $T = \text{tor } Z(G)$  is infinite, then  $K$  is finitely generated. Let  $H$  be a cyclic non-normal  $q$ -subgroup of  $G$  ( $q$  prime). If  $L$  is a subgroup of  $Z(G)$  with no element of order  $q$ , then  $H$  is the  $q$ -component of  $HL$ , hence  $HL$  is not normal in  $G$  and  $L$  is finitely generated. By using this observation, the proof can be easily completed.  $\square$

**Lemma 2.3.** *Let  $G$  be a  $\mathcal{D}$ -group. Suppose that  $Z(G)$  contains a torsion-free subgroup  $A$  such that  $G/A$  is not periodic and  $A$  is not finitely generated. Then  $G$  is abelian.*

*Proof* — Let  $H/A$  be a cyclic subgroup of  $G/A$ . Since  $H$  is abelian and  $A$  is not finitely generated,  $H$  is not finitely generated and so it is normal in  $G$ . Hence  $G/A$  is a Dedekind group. Since  $G/A$  is non-periodic, it is abelian. We proceed now by induction on the rank  $r$  of  $A$  (which may be assumed

finite by Lemma 2.2) to prove that  $G$  is abelian. Let  $r = 1$  and assume that  $G$  is not abelian. Since  $G$  is generated by its elements which have infinite order modulo  $A$ , there exists  $a \in G \setminus Z(G)$  of infinite order modulo  $A$  and  $b \in G$  such that  $c = [a, b] \neq 1$ . Clearly  $c \in A$ , and the  $p'$ -component of  $A/\langle c \rangle$  is infinite for a suitable prime  $p$ . Let  $H = \langle c^p \rangle$  and let  $P/H$  be the  $p'$ -component of  $A/H$ . Since  $P\langle a \rangle$  is not finitely generated it is normal in  $G$ , so that  $c \in P\langle a \rangle \cap A = P(\langle a \rangle \cap A) = P$ . Since  $c$  has order  $p$  modulo  $H$ , this is impossible. Hence  $G$  is abelian if  $r = 1$ . Suppose now  $r > 1$  and let  $H_1, H_2$  be two nontrivial cyclic subgroups of  $A$  such that  $H_1 \cap H_2 = 1$ . For  $i = 1, 2$  let  $T_i/H_i$  be the torsion subgroup of  $A/H_i$ . Then  $T_1 \cap T_2 = 1$ . If one of the subgroups  $T_1$  and  $T_2$  is not finitely generated, then, by the case  $r = 1$ ,  $G$  is abelian. If  $T_1$  and  $T_2$  are both finitely generated, then  $A/T_1$  and  $A/T_2$  are not finitely generated, so that, by induction,  $G/T_1$  and  $G/T_2$  are abelian and  $G' \leq T_1 \cap T_2 = 1$ .  $\square$

**Proposition 2.4.** *A torsion-free nilpotent  $\mathcal{D}$ -group  $G$  is either finitely generated or abelian.*

*Proof* — Assume that  $G$  is not abelian. It follows from Lemma 2.3 that  $Z(G)$  is finitely generated. By induction on the nilpotency class of  $G$ , we obtain that  $G/Z(G)$  is abelian and, in particular,  $G'$  is finitely generated. For any subgroup  $H$  of  $G$ , the quotient  $H/H_G$  satisfies the maximal condition, so that  $G/Z(G)$ , and hence  $G$ , is finitely generated (see [8], Theorem 5.9).  $\square$

Let  $p$  be a prime and let  $\mathbb{Q}_p$  be the additive group of all rational numbers whose denominator is a power of  $p$ . Let  $\alpha$  be the automorphism of  $\mathbb{Q}_p$  defined by  $x^\alpha = px$ . Then  $\mathbb{Q}_p \rtimes \langle \alpha \rangle$  is an example of a non-abelian finitely generated torsion-free metabelian  $\mathcal{D}$ -group.

### Proof of the Theorem

Let  $G$  be a group in  $\text{Max-}n^-$  which is neither noetherian nor a Dedekind group. Suppose first that  $G$  is soluble-by-finite. For each subgroup  $H$  of  $G$ , the quotient  $H/H_G$  has the maximal condition. Since  $G'$  is polycyclic-by-finite (see Lemma 2.1(b)), this implies that  $G/Z(G)$  is polycyclic-by-finite by Theorem 5.9 of [8]. In particular  $Z(G)$  is not finitely generated. By Lemma 2.1 it follows that  $G/Z(G)$  is a Dedekind group, so that  $G$  is nilpotent. By Proposition 2.4, either  $G' \leq \text{tor } G$  or  $G/\text{tor } G$  is finitely generated. In the latter case  $\text{tor } G$  is not finitely generated, thus  $G/\text{tor } G$  is abelian. Then  $G'$  is torsion and so finite in any case. Hence  $G/Z(G)$  is periodic and so finite.

Let  $T = \text{tor } Z(G)$ . Suppose first that  $G/T$  is finitely generated. Then, by Lemma 2.2, it follows that  $T$  contains a subgroup  $A \simeq \mathbb{Z}(p^\infty)$  such that  $G/A$  is finitely generated. We conclude that  $G/A$  is a Dedekind group and  $G$  is of type (c) in our statement. Assume now that  $G/T$  is not finitely generated. Since  $G/Z(G)$  is finite, it follows by Lemma 2.2 that  $T$  is finite and that every finite subgroup of  $G$  is normal. Then  $G$  contains a non-normal infinite cyclic subgroup  $H$ . As  $H \cap G' = 1$ , we have  $H_G = H \cap Z(G) \neq 1$  and  $H/H_G$  is a finite non-normal subgroup of  $G/H_G$ . By the above part of the proof,  $G/H_G$  contains a central subgroup  $P/H_G \simeq \mathbb{Z}(p^\infty)$  such that  $G/P$  is a finitely generated Dedekind group. Then  $P \leq Z(G)$  and  $P = P_0 \times P_1$ , where  $P_0$  is finite and  $P_1 \simeq \mathbb{Q}_p$ . The quotient  $G/P_1$  is a Dedekind group and, since  $G' \cap P_1 = 1$ , it is hamiltonian and so finite. Hence  $|G'| = 2$  and  $G/Z(G)$  has exponent 2. By Lemma 2.2, every  $p'$ -subgroup of  $G/H_G$  is normal, so that  $H/H_G$  is a  $p$ -group and  $p$  divides  $|G/Z(G)|$ . Hence  $p = 2$  and  $P_1 \simeq \mathbb{Q}_2$ . Let  $V/P_1$  be the 2'-component of  $G/P_1$ . Then  $V$  is abelian, since  $V' \leq G' \cap P_1 = 1$ . Hence  $V = V_0 \times V_1$ , where  $V_0$  is finite and  $V_1 \simeq \mathbb{Q}_2$ . Also  $G/V_1$  is a finite hamiltonian group. Let  $U/V_1$  be the Sylow 2-subgroup of  $G/V_1$ . Then  $G' \leq U$  and  $V_1 G'/G' \simeq V_1 \simeq \mathbb{Q}_2$ , so that there exists a subgroup  $B$  of  $U$  containing  $G'$  such that  $U = (V_1 G')B$  and  $V_1 G' \cap B = G'$  (see [9], vol.I, p.223). Hence  $U = V_1 \times B$  and  $B$  is finite. Therefore  $G = UV = V(V_1 \times B) = V_1 \times (BV_0)$  and  $BV_0 \simeq G/V_1$  is hamiltonian. Then  $G$  is of type (d) and the theorem holds for soluble-by-finite groups.

Let now  $G$  be locally graded. Let  $N = G''$  be the second term of the derived series of  $G$  and let  $H$  be a subgroup of finite index in  $N$ . It follows from Lemma 2.1(b) that  $H_G$  has finite index in  $N$ . By the first part of the proof, the non-noetherian group  $G/H_G$  is metabelian, so that  $H_G = N$  and  $N$  has no proper subgroups of finite index. By the definition of locally graded group,  $N = 1$  and  $G$  is soluble. The necessity of the condition is proved.

Conversely, a group of type (a) or (b) satisfies trivially  $\text{Max-}n^-$ . Let  $G$  be a group of type (c). Then  $G = NA$ , where  $A \simeq \mathbb{Z}(p^\infty)$  is contained in  $Z(G)$ , the quotient  $G/A$  is a Dedekind group,  $N$  is polycyclic (and obviously normal). Assume that  $G$  has an infinite, strictly ascending sequence of non-normal subgroups

$$K_1 < K_2 < \dots < K_n < \dots$$

and let  $K$  be the union of the  $K_i$ . Since  $G/A$  is finitely generated,  $K/(A \cap K)$  has Max, so that  $A \cap K \notin \text{Max}$  and  $A \cap K = A$ . Then  $A \leq K$ . Since  $G/A$  is a Dedekind group,  $K \triangleleft G$ . Since  $N$  satisfies the maximal condition, there exists an integer  $n$  such that  $K \cap N = K_n \cap N$ , and so  $K \cap N \leq K_n < K \triangleleft G$ . But  $K/(K \cap N) \simeq KN/N \simeq \mathbb{Z}(p^\infty)$ , so that  $K_n$  must be normal in  $G$ . This contradiction shows that  $G$  satisfies  $\text{Max-}n^-$ . Let finally  $G = Q \times F$  be a group of type (d), where  $Q \simeq \mathbb{Q}_2$  and  $F$  is a finite hamiltonian group. Let  $K_1 \leq K_2 \leq \dots \leq K_n \leq \dots$  be an ascending chain of non-normal subgroups of  $G$  and let  $K$  be its union. It is clear that  $N = K_1 \cap Q \neq 1$ ; thus  $Q/N = A \times D$ , where  $A \simeq \mathbb{Z}(2^\infty)$  and  $D$  is a finite abelian group of odd order. Hence  $G/N = A \times D \times (FN/N)$  is a group of type (c), and so it belongs to  $\text{Max-}n^-$ . It follows that  $K = K_n$  for some integer  $n$ . Therefore  $G \in \text{Max-}n^-$ .  $\square$

**Remark.** The proof of the Theorem also shows that a *PC-group which is a  $\mathcal{D}$ -group satisfies  $\text{Max-}n^-$* . Here a *PC-group* is a group  $G$  such that  $G/C_G(x^G)$  is polycyclic-by-finite for each element  $x$  of  $G$  (see [8]).

**Corollary 2.5.** *Let  $G$  be a non-noetherian locally graded group in  $\text{Max-}n^-$ . Then  $G$  is a nilpotent central-by-finite group of class at most 2.*

*Proof* — We have only to prove that a group  $G$  of type (c) (see Theorem) has class 2. We may assume that  $G$  is a 2-group and that  $G/A$  is a finite hamiltonian group, where the subgroup  $A$  is isomorphic with  $\mathbb{Z}(2^\infty)$ . Clearly the Schur multiplier  $M(G/Z(G))$  of  $G/Z(G)$  has exponent 2, so that  $G' \cap Z(G)$  has exponent 2 and  $|A \cap G'| \leq 2$ . It follows that  $|G'| \leq 4$ . Hence, for each  $x \in G$ , we have  $|G : C_G(x)| \leq 4$ . But  $A \leq C_G(x)$  and each subgroup of  $G/A$  of index  $\leq 4$  contains  $G'A/A$ , so that  $G' \leq Z(G)$  and  $G$  has class 2.  $\square$

**Corollary 2.6.** *Every non-Dedekind group  $G$  in  $\text{Max-}n^-$  is countable.*

*Proof* — By Lemma 2.1(b), the union of any chain of soluble subgroups of  $G$  is still soluble. Hence we can apply Zorn's Lemma to obtain a maximal soluble subgroup  $H$  of  $G$ . We may assume that  $H < G$ . Then  $H$  is polycyclic by Lemma 2.1(c) and  $H^G$  satisfies the maximal condition on subgroups. Hence  $H^G$  has only countably many subgroups, so that  $|G : N_G(H)|$  is countable. But  $N_G(H) = H$ , so the corollary is proved.  $\square$

### 3. Other results and counterexamples

Examples of soluble non-noetherian  $\mathcal{D}$ -groups which are not nilpotent (and so do not satisfy the maximal condition on non-normal subgroups) are easily obtained (for instance the example given in §2, or any non-central extension of a Prüfer group by a finitely generated Dedekind group). Even in the nilpotent case the property  $\mathcal{D}$  does not imply  $\text{Max-}n^-$ , as the following example shows.

**Example 3.1.** Let  $p$  be a prime and  $A$  be a torsion-free abelian group of rank  $n > 1$  with no infinite cyclic quotients containing a finitely generated subgroup  $B$  such that  $A/B \simeq \mathbb{Z}(p^\infty)$  (for the existence of such groups, see [10] or [9], vol.II, p.128). Since  $A$  is  $p$ -minimax, the Schur multiplier  $M(A)$  of  $A$  is also  $p$ -minimax. It is well-known that  $M(A)$  has torsion-free rank  $n(n-1)/2 > 0$ . On the other hand,  $\text{Hom}(M(A), \mathbb{Z}) \simeq \text{Hom}(A \otimes A, \mathbb{Z}) = 0$ , so that  $M(A)$  has no infinite cyclic quotients and hence it has a quotient isomorphic with  $\mathbb{Z}(p^\infty)$ . Consider  $C \simeq \mathbb{Z}(p^\infty)$  as a trivial  $A$ -module and let  $\varphi : M(A) \twoheadrightarrow C$  be an epimorphism. Then  $\varphi$  determines a central extension:

$$C \twoheadrightarrow G \twoheadrightarrow A$$

where  $G' = C$ . Assume that there exists a subgroup  $H$  of  $G$  which is not finitely generated and does not contain  $G'$ . Then  $H \cap G'$  is finite and  $HG'/G'$  is not finitely generated. Let  $K/G'$  be a finitely generated subgroup of  $G/G'$  such that  $G/K \simeq \mathbb{Z}(p^\infty)$ . Then  $HK/K \simeq HG'/((H \cap K)G')$  is not finitely generated, and so  $G = HK$ . Then  $G/HG'$  is finitely generated, hence finite, since  $G/G' \simeq A$  has no infinite cyclic quotient. Therefore  $H$  is a near-complement of  $G'$  in  $G$ . This is impossible, since the cohomology class of  $C \twoheadrightarrow G \twoheadrightarrow A$  has infinite order (see [20]). This contradiction proves that every subgroup of  $G$  which is not finitely generated contains  $G'$  and so is normal. Thus  $G$  is a nilpotent  $\mathcal{D}$ -group. On the other hand,  $G$  does not satisfy  $\text{Max-}n^-$ , since  $G'$  is infinite.  $\square$

It is well-known that a soluble group satisfies the maximal condition on subgroups if and only if its abelian subgroups have the same property, and a similar result holds for soluble groups satisfying the minimal condition on subgroups (see [18]). On the other hand there exist soluble groups which are not Min-by-Max whose abelian subgroups are Min-by-Max. The structure of groups of this type has been investigated by Newell [14,15]. Our next result gives a description of those nilpotent  $\mathcal{D}$ -groups which do not satisfy  $\text{Max-}n^-$  as groups with the property considered above.

**Proposition 3.2.** *Let  $G$  be a nilpotent group and let  $T$  be the torsion subgroup of  $G$ . Then  $G$  is a  $\mathcal{D}$ -group not in  $\text{Max-}n^-$  if and only if it satisfies the following conditions:*

- (i)  $G' \simeq \mathbb{Z}(p^\infty)$  and  $T/G'$  is finite;
- (ii) every abelian subgroup of  $G$  is Min-by-Max but  $G$  is not Min-by-Max.

*Proof* — Let  $G$  be a nilpotent  $\mathcal{D}$ -group not in  $\text{Max-}n^-$ . The remark following the Theorem shows in particular that  $G'$  is infinite. Assume that  $T$  contains two infinite subgroups  $A$  and  $B$  such that  $A \cap B = 1$ . Then  $A$  and  $B$  are normal in  $G$  and the factor groups  $G/A$  and  $G/B$  are Dedekind groups. Hence  $G'/(A \cap G') \simeq AG'/A$  and  $G'/(B \cap G') \simeq BG'/B$  are finite, so that  $G'$  is finite. By this contradiction, it follows that  $T$  does not contain such a pair  $A, B$ . It follows that each abelian subgroup of  $T$  is either finite or direct product of a finite group by a Prüfer group. Hence  $T$  is a Černikov group. By the Theorem,  $G/T$  is not finitely generated, so that  $G$  is not Min-by-Max and  $G' \leq T$  by Proposition 2.4. Then  $T$  is infinite and contains a subgroup of finite index  $P \simeq \mathbb{Z}(p^\infty)$ . Now  $G/P$  is a Dedekind group and so is abelian, as  $T < G$ . Thus  $G' = P$  and (i) holds. Let  $A$  be a maximal abelian subgroup of  $G$ . Since  $G' \leq Z(G)$ , then  $G' \leq A$  and  $A = G' \times B$  for a suitable subgroup  $B$  of  $A$ . Since  $G' \cap B = 1$  and  $B$  is not contained in  $Z(G)$ , it follows that  $B$  is not normal in  $G$  and so it is finitely generated. Whence  $A$  is Min-by-Max and also (ii) is proved.

Conversely, let  $G$  satisfy (i) and (ii) and let  $H$  be a subgroup of  $G$  which is not finitely generated. Then  $H$  contains an abelian subgroup  $A$  which is not finitely generated. Since  $A$  is Min-by-Max, the torsion subgroup of  $A$  must be infinite, so that  $A$  contains  $G'$  and  $G' \leq H$ . Hence  $H \triangleleft G$  and  $G$  is a nilpotent  $\mathcal{D}$ -group. Since  $G'$  is infinite,  $G$  does not belong to  $\text{Max-}n^-$ .  $\square$

**Corollary 3.3.** *Let  $G$  be a nilpotent  $\mathcal{D}$ -group with torsion-free rank 1. Then  $G$  satisfies the maximal condition on non-normal subgroups.*

*Proof* — Assume that  $G$  does not satisfy  $\text{Max-}n^-$ . Then it follows from Proposition 3.2 that  $G' \leq Z(G)$  and  $G/G'$  has a locally cyclic torsion-free subgroup of finite index  $A/G'$ . Clearly  $A$  is abelian and  $G$  is abelian-by-finite, which is impossible by Proposition 3.2.  $\square$

By Proposition 3.2 and a result of Baer [1], nilpotent  $\mathcal{D}$ -groups not in  $\text{Max-}n^-$  are minimax groups. More precisely, we have:

**Corollary 3.4.** *Let  $G$  be a nilpotent  $\mathcal{D}$ -group which is not in  $\text{Max-}n^-$ . If  $A = G' \times B$  is any maximal abelian subgroup of  $G$ , then  $G/A$  is an infinite  $p$ -group with the minimal condition and  $A = B^G$ .*

*Proof* — The quotient  $G/A$  is isomorphic with a group of automorphisms of  $A$  which centralizes  $G' \simeq \mathbb{Z}(p^\infty)$  and  $A/G' \simeq B$ , so that  $G/A$  embeds in  $\text{Hom}(B, \mathbb{Z}(p^\infty))$ , which is a  $p$ -group with the minimal condition, since  $B$  is finitely generated by Proposition 3.2. Since  $G$  is not  $\text{Min-by-Max}$ ,  $G/A$  is infinite. Finally  $C_G(B^G) = C_G(A) = A$ , so that  $B^G$  is not finitely generated and  $A = B^G$ .  $\square$

It follows easily from Corollary 3.4 that every nilpotent  $\mathcal{D}$ -groups which is not in  $\text{Max-}n^-$  has a normal subgroup of the type described in Example 3.1. The corollary above also has the following consequence:

**Corollary 3.5.** *Let the nilpotent group  $G$  satisfy the maximal condition on abelian non-normal subgroups. Then  $G$  satisfies the maximal condition on non-normal subgroups.*

*Proof* — The same argument used in the proof of Lemma 2.1(a), shows that every abelian non-normal subgroup of  $G$  is finitely generated. Let  $H$  be any non-normal subgroup of  $G$ . Since  $H$  is generated by its maximal abelian subgroups,  $H$  must contain a maximal abelian subgroup  $U$  which is not normal in  $G$ . Hence  $U$  is finitely generated and it follows easily that also  $H$  is finitely generated. Thus  $G$  is a  $\mathcal{D}$ -group. If  $G$  does not satisfy  $\text{Max-}n^-$  and  $A = G' \times B$  is a maximal abelian subgroup of  $G$ , then  $B^G/B = A/B$  does not satisfy the maximal condition on subgroups. This contradiction proves that  $G \in \text{Max-}n^-$ .  $\square$

The hypothesis of nilpotency in Corollary 3.5 cannot be weakened. In fact, if  $A$  is the direct product of a Prüfer 2-group and a cyclic group of order 4 and  $\alpha$  is the inversion automorphism of  $A$ , the hypercentral metabelian group  $G = A \rtimes \langle \alpha \rangle$  has the maximal condition on abelian non-normal subgroups, but is not a  $\mathcal{D}$ -group.

## References

- [1] R.BAER, Polyminimaxgruppen, *Math. Ann.* **175** (1968) 1–43.
- [2] B.BRUNO and R.E.PHILLIPS, Groups with restricted non-normal subgroups, *Math. Z.* **176** (1981) 199–221.
- [3] B.BRUNO and R.E.PHILLIPS, On minimal conditions related to Miller-Moreno type groups, *Rend. Sem. Mat. Univ. Padova* **69** (1983) 153–168.
- [4] S.N.ČERNIKOV, Infinite groups with prescribed properties of their systems of infinite subgroups, *Dokl. Akad. Nauk SSSR* **159** (1964) 759–760 = *Soviet Math. Dokl.* **5** (1964) 1610–1611.

- [5] S.N.ČERNIKOV, Groups with given properties of systems of infinite subgroups, *Ukrain. Mat. Ž.* **19** (1967) 111–131 = *Ukrainian Math. J.* **19** (1967) 715–731.
- [6] S.N.ČERNIKOV, Infinite nonabelian groups with minimal condition for non-normal subgroups, *Mat. Zametki* **6** (1969) 11–18 = *Math. Notes* **6** (1969) 465–468.
- [7] S.N.ČERNIKOV, Infinite nonabelian groups with the minimal condition for noninvariant abelian subgroups, *Dokl. Akad. Nauk SSSR* **184** (1969) 786–789 = *Soviet Math. Dokl.* **10** (1969) 172–175.
- [8] S.FRANCIOSI, F.DE GIOVANNI and M.J.TOMKINSON, Groups with polycyclic-by-finite conjugacy classes, *Boll. Un. Mat. Ital.* (7) **4-B** (1990) 35–55.
- [9] L.FUCHS, “Infinite Abelian Groups”, Academic Press, New York and London, 1970.
- [10] L.FUCHS and F.LOONSTRA, On the cancellation of modules in direct sums over Dedekind domains, *Indag. Math.* **33** (1971) 163–169.
- [11] N.S.HEKSTER and H.W.LENSTRA, JR, Groups with finitely many non-normal subgroups, *Arch. Math.* **54** (1990) 225–231.
- [12] L.IVÁN, On groups satisfying the minimal condition on certain subgroups, *Period. Math. Hungarica* **14** (1983) 117–124.
- [13] L.A.KURDACHENKO and V.V.PYLAEV, Groups rich with almost-normal subgroups, *Ukrain. Mat. Ž.* **40** (1988) 326–330 = *Ukrainian Math. J.* **40** (1988) 278–281.
- [14] M.L.NEWELL, On soluble Min-by-Max groups, *Math. Ann.* **186** (1970) 282–296.
- [15] M.L.NEWELL, A subgroup characterization of soluble Min-by-Max groups, *Arch. Math.* **21** (1970) 128–131.
- [16] R.E.PHILLIPS, Infinite groups with normality conditions on infinite subgroups, *Rocky Mountain J. Math.* **7** (1977) 19–30.
- [17] R.E.PHILLIPS and J.S.WILSON, On certain minimal conditions for infinite groups, *J. Algebra* **51** (1978) 41–68.
- [18] D.J.S.ROBINSON, “Finiteness Conditions and Generalized Soluble Groups”, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 1972.
- [19] D.J.S.ROBINSON, “A Course in the Theory of Groups”, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 1982.
- [20] D.J.S.ROBINSON, Splitting theorems for infinite groups, *Symposia Math.* **17** (1976) 441–470.

Dipartimento di Matematica  
 Università di Napoli  
 Via Mezzocannone, 8  
 I-80134 Napoli  
 Italy